Northland Community and Technical College - MN

HLC ID 1794

OPEN PATHWAY: Reaffirmation Review   Review Date: 9/30/2019

Dr. Dennis J. Bona
President

Tom Bordenkircher   Paula Davis   Rick Edgington
HLC Liaison   *Review Team Chair*   *Federal Compliance Reviewer*

David Keller   Steven Lewis
Team Member   *Team Member*

Context and Nature of Review

Review Date

9/30/2019
Mid-Cycle Reviews include:

- The Year 4 Review in the Open and Standard Pathways
- The Biennial Review for Applying institutions

Reaffirmation Reviews include:

- The Year 10 Review in the Open and Standard Pathways
- The Review for Initial Candidacy for Applying institutions
- The Review for Initial Accreditation for Applying institutions
- The Year 4 Review for Standard Pathway institutions that are in their first accreditation cycle after attaining initial accreditation

Scope of Review

- Reaffirmation Review
- Federal Compliance
- On-site Visit
- Multi-Campus Visit (if applicable)

- East Grand Forks, MN

Institutional Context

There is no institutional context.

Interactions with Constituencies

Team Chair met with President

President's Council that included the President, Dean of Student Affairs, East Grand Forks (EGF) Campus Dean, VP of Administrative Services and CFO, Associate Dean of Aerospace, Director of the Foundation, Dean of Workforce/Director of Athletics, Thief River Falls (TRF) Campus Dean, Provost, and Chair of Human Resources Officer (CHRO)

Assurance Argument Writing Team that included the Provost, Dean of Student Affairs, VP of Administrative Services/CFO, EGF Campus Dean, TRF Campus Dean, President

Criterion 1 & 2 included Provost, VP of Administrative Services, English Instructor, Chemistry Faculty, Practical Nursing Faculty/EGF Chapter of Minnesota State College Faculty (MSCF) President, History Instructor, Dietetic Technician Program Director, Dean of Student Affairs, Practical Nursing Director and Instructor, Business Faculty,

English Faculty, Welding Instructor and MSCF Representative.

Strategic Planning included TRF Campus Dean, EGF Campus Dean, Provost, President, Radiologic Technology Program Director, Marketing, Grant Support Officer, IT Director, Faculty Member, Communication Coordinator.

Criterion 3 & 4 included Agriculture Instructor, Welding Instructor, Administrative Support Staff, Library Assistant, Provost, Dean of Student Affairs, Architecture Instructor, HVAC Instructor, Construction Electric Instructors (2), Construction Plumbing Instructor, D2L Site Administrator/Web Support, Math Instructor, ADN Nursing Faculty, Director of Academic Success, Computer Science and Networking Instructor, Early Childhood Instructor, Radiology Technology, Welding, Biology Instructors.

Criterion 5 group included both faculty (10) and staff (5)

A group of 7 students from the EGF Campus and 3 from the TRF Campus (by interactive video)

Student Affairs, Admissions, Counseling included Dean of Student Affairs, Practical Nursing/Clinical Coordinator, Director of Academic Success Center, Academic Advisor (3), Director of Enrollment Management & Admissions, Registrar & Director of Advising, Enrollment Specialist, DARS Executor, Student Services Specialist, and Counselor.

Faculty Open Forum included 14

Administrative Affairs, Program Review, Budgeting group included Instructor from Rad Technology/APR Committee, Early Childhood/APR Committee and Faculty Development Coordinator, TRF Campus Dean, EGF Campus Dean, Provost, Associate Dean Aerospace, Dean of Student Affairs, Welding Instructor, Biology Instructor.

Advisory Committee and Community Members included individuals from the Chamber, EGF ISD 595, and 4 major industries/employers.

Institutional Research Group included Dean of Student Affairs, Registrar & Director of Advising, Provost, Chief Financial Officer, Director of Information Technology, Financial Aid Director, CHRO, D2L Administrator.

Academic Affairs & Standards Council included the Provost, Sociology Instructor, EGF Campus Dean, Computer and Networking Instructor, Registrar & Director of Advising, Dean of Student Affairs, Agriculture faculty, Associate Dean, Dean, 4 additional faculty and D2L/Web Support.

Human Resources for review of selected faculty credentials

During Campus tours, we interacted with various faculty, staff, and students.

Additional Documents

There are no additional documents reviewed.

1 - Mission

The institution's mission is clear and articulated publicly; it guides the institution's operations.

1.A - Core Component 1.A

The institution's mission is broadly understood within the institution and guides its operations.

1. The mission statement is developed through a process suited to the nature and culture of the institution and is adopted by the governing board.
2. The institution's academic programs, student support services, and enrollment profile are consistent with its stated mission.
3. The institution's planning and budgeting priorities align with and support the mission. (This sub-component may be addressed by reference to the response to Criterion 5.C.1.)

Rating

Met

Evidence

In 2017 Northland Community and Technical College (NCTC) hired Praxis Strategy Group to guide revision of the College's mission and vision statements. This process engaged numerous internal and external stakeholders and resulted in a number of new ideas to support strategic planning and the revised mission statement. Based on the assurance report and conversations with NCTC personnel, the mission and vision statements are reviewed with each update of the college's strategic planning process. The mission was last approved by the Minnesota Board of Trustees in March 2019.

Department and program mission statements align with the institutional mission statement. Faculty reported the revised mission also led to updating institutional learning outcomes (ILOs) and program learning outcomes.

The assurance report indicates the academic programs, student support services, and enrollment profile are consistent with the mission and vision statements in that they provide a more global aspect and the offerings cover a range of occupations that provide high skill/wage employment and new programs focus on demographic shifts.

NCTC is working hard to serve both traditional student populations as well as the recent influx of immigrants from Nepal and east Africa. The mix of transfer and technical training programs seems to serve the community and businesses well. NCTC delivers their courses both face-to-face and online to high school and adult populations.

NCTC is part of the Minnesota State system which includes 30 community and technical colleges and 7 universities. The centralized system dictates the two primary revenue sources of state

appropriations and tuition rates. There are seven unions representing different employee groups on campus and each contract is negotiated at the state level. Conversations with the President's Council suggest budget items are collected and discussed, but precisely how they are prioritized remains unclear. See 5C for more details regarding alignment of budgeting and strategic planning with the NCTC mission.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

1.B - Core Component 1.B

The mission is articulated publicly.

1. The institution clearly articulates its mission through one or more public documents, such as statements of purpose, vision, values, goals, plans, or institutional priorities.
2. The mission document or documents are current and explain the extent of the institution's emphasis on the various aspects of its mission, such as instruction, scholarship, research, application of research, creative works, clinical service, public service, economic development, and religious or cultural purpose.
3. The mission document or documents identify the nature, scope, and intended constituents of the higher education programs and services the institution provides.

Rating

Met

Evidence

NCTC's mission and vision are publicly articulated in a variety of formats including the College website, the academic catalog, and handbooks for faculty and students. The mission, vision, and values are prominently displayed on posters near multiple building entrances. Team interviews confirmed employees are aware of, and guided by, the updated mission and vision statements.

The assurance argument included substantial discussion of the demographic change in the service area and the shift in focus at the institution to ensure all learners are appropriately served, detailed in a robust Diversity Plan for FY 2017-2020. Discussions with college personnel failed to uncover systematic change resulting from this plan, and there were no metrics identified to measure the success of the plan. NCTC indicates that there was a gap in the strategic planning during transition of leadership. However, they indicated that with the new mission and vision statements completed, the Diversity and Academic Master plans are currently under revision and will be completed in 2019-2020.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

1.C - Core Component 1.C

The institution understands the relationship between its mission and the diversity of society.

1. The institution addresses its role in a multicultural society.
2. The institution's processes and activities reflect attention to human diversity as appropriate within its mission and for the constituencies it serves.

Rating

Met

Evidence

NCTC's commitment to diversity is evident through its updated mission statement, Diversity Plan, and inclusion of Social Engagement as one of five Institutional Learning Outcomes. Social Engagement strives to ensure students will be prepared to practice social engagement that addresses environmental responsibility, civic engagement, and global diversity. This outcome was recently revised, so little data identifying its success is currently available. Some data is available for the previous version of this outcome, titled "Global and Civic Responsibility.

NCTC's service area includes significant numbers of returning adult students, first generation students, and a significant population of Nepalese and Somali immigrants. Additionally the College serves two of the three poorest counties in Minnesota. The College has attempted to support students in a variety of ways including eliminating the application fee, introducing multiple measures for placement, providing a food bank, collecting coats, and providing bus service between locations. NCTC's Foundation offers scholarships, and many student club and organization sponsors help arrange fundraising events relevant for their diverse student body in support of student equipment and material purchases.

Community partners identified NCTC as a key leader in integrating new immigrants into the region. Through a Department of Labor grant, the New American program provided essential work skills including language acquisition and basic manufacturing skills. NCTC engages with a community organization, "Global Friends Coalition" in a variety of ways. They provided indirect support of a program they developed to provide 26 Somali immigrants driver's education.The Director of Student Life was very successful in applying his strategy to diversify the student government and student ambassadors.

The Diversity Plan identifies four goals, each with numerous action steps, to meet community needs:

- Recruit and retain a diverse student population providing equitable access and opportunity in order to be successful in higher education.
- Promote awareness and recruitment efforts to increase diversity of faculty and staff to be representative of the student population.
- Foster academic success of a diverse student body.
- Ensure leadership commitment and accountability to diversity efforts at all levels of the

institution through an aligned strategic effort.

The assurance argument reports the NCTC student body is more diverse than the communities served, while the staff and faculty remain less diverse. They do identify a variety of strategies to increase employee diversity, including intentional recruiting efforts through organizations and agencies that serve diverse populations, ensuring search committees are as diverse as possible, and supporting retention efforts such as peer mentoring, employee orientation, and providing professional development opportunities.

The only data cited to measure progress towards the Diversity Plan goals is student and employee demographic data supplied by the Minnesota State system. This illustrates a common theme uncovered during the team visit. NCTC has many great ideas and plans, but is not intentional in designing measures and collecting data to determine the extent to which an initiative is successful. See 3.C and 4.B for additional information.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

1.D - Core Component 1.D

The institution's mission demonstrates commitment to the public good.

1. Actions and decisions reflect an understanding that in its educational role the institution serves the public, not solely the institution, and thus entails a public obligation.
2. The institution's educational responsibilities take primacy over other purposes, such as generating financial returns for investors, contributing to a related or parent organization, or supporting external interests.
3. The institution engages with its identified external constituencies and communities of interest and responds to their needs as its mission and capacity allow.

Rating

Met

Evidence

Conversations with NCTC administration, staff, and faculty consistently confirmed a passion for serving the citizens and businesses in the service area. The College provides Adult Basic Education and Head Start early education, and it houses a State of Minnesota Workforce Center. NCTC hosts a variety of events for middle and high school students including VEX Robotics, reading and mathematics competitions, and athletic tournaments. Industry partners are invited to campus to conduct mock interviews and showcase their employment opportunities. The NCTC President serves on community boards in both East Grand Forks and Thief River Falls, and annually delivers a state of the College presentation at a Chamber of Commerce event. NCTC did solicit input from the public while developing the strategic plan.

NCTC recently added a service learning requirement for all students intending to earn an Associate's degree. This intentional engagement of students with the community serves the public and broadens students' learning opportunities.

NCTC maintains numerous partnerships with K-12 districts and other Minnesota State institutions. High schools students can enroll in face-to-face courses through the College in the High School program and online through Online College in High School. A partnership with East Grand Forks public schools provides food service to the East Grand Forks campus. In Thief River Falls there is an arrangement to share athletic facilities with the College and public schools.

To support students in the building trades, annually NCTC and Forx Builders Association partner to design and build a home in the area. Students from the Architectural Technology program create home designs from which a single design is selected for construction. Students from Carpentry, HVAC, Construction Electricity, and Construction Plumbing complete the corresponding stages of the home-building process. Forx Builders does not provide student instruction or oversight, and NCTC receives no proceeds from the sale of the home.

The structure of the Minnesota State system makes clear that all institutions are public entities.

Through a single state board, the Minnesota State system strives to provide high quality education to all students. Trustees clearly stated the Board's responsibility is to govern, not manage the institutions, leaving responsibility for each president to meet the needs of the local community. Twice per year NCTC facilitates advisory committee meetings by hosting a single event on campus for community and business partners to gather for a meal and then to break out into individual advisory meetings. NCTC is also part of several consortial arrangements to enhance learning opportunities for learners. These additional opportunities include Distance Minnesota – a seat-sharing arrangement with two other regional colleges, College in the High School, and Online College in the High School. The assurance argument also identifies university partnerships in select programs, including ADN to BSN transfer pathway with Bemidji State University, joint admissions programs, and a host of articulation agreements with Minnesota and North Dakota universities.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

1.S - Criterion 1 - Summary

The institution's mission is clear and articulated publicly; it guides the institution's operations.

Evidence

The mission and vision statements are current and guide academic programming and student support services. Mission and vision statements are publicly articulated on the College website, academic catalog, student and faculty handbooks, and throughout the campus. Institutional, program, and course learning outcomes logically follow from the revised mission.

NCTC demonstrates its commitment to diversity through their updated mission, Diversity Plan, and inclusion of Social Engagement as an ILO. The College strives to serve all constituents including traditional college age students, returning adult students, first generation students, and new immigrant students. Community and business partners identified numerous examples of the critical role NCTC plays in integrating new immigrants into the community and meeting employment needs. NCTC acknowledges employee diversity lags behind student diversity and has appropriate strategies in place to increase diversity as new hiring occurs.

In addition to transfer and career and technical education, NCTC has, co-located on one or more of its campuses, Adult Basic Education, Head Start early education, and state of Minnesota Workforce Center. NCTC maintains numerous partnerships with education, community, and business partners to provide additional experiences and opportunities for all learners.

2 - Integrity: Ethical and Responsible Conduct

The institution acts with integrity; its conduct is ethical and responsible.

2.A - Core Component 2.A

The institution operates with integrity in its financial, academic, personnel, and auxiliary functions; it establishes and follows policies and processes for fair and ethical behavior on the part of its governing board, administration, faculty, and staff.

Rating

Met

Evidence

Northland Community and Technical College is governed by a 15-member state board of trustees appointed by the governor which has oversight of all 37 public colleges and universities in the state of Minnesota. The board's responsibilities include oversight of system planning, academic programs, fiscal management, personnel, admissions requirements, tuition and fees, and rules and regulations. The Board approves all of NCTC's programs of study and the awarding of academic degrees, certificates, and diplomas.

The Minnesota Office of Equity and Inclusion consults, advises, trains, and provides policy development in the areas of equity, inclusion, diversity, equal opportunity, and affirmative action. The office provides programs and services to support its colleges and universities, as well as the state system office. In addition, the office partners with communities, businesses, and civic and educational organizations to impact student success, procurement practices, and campus climate. The administration at NCTC maintains a regular relationship with this office and utilizes these services on an as-needed basis.

NCTC's governance policies are structured upon the state board's guidelines, which outline all relevant operating procedures. These policies include financial planning, analysis, and reporting; facilities management; tuition and fees structures; collective bargaining agreements; student code of conduct; and intellectual properties, among other policy oversight. The consistency of the Minnesota state system policies, procedures, and guidelines helps to assure that NCTC and all other state colleges and universities operate with integrity.

Working with the state's Office of General Counsel (OGC), NCTC is able to make adjustments or additions to state governance policies specific to NCTC's unique needs. The Board of Trustees verified that while they serve a governing role for state colleges, each college is allowed the autonomy to create specific policies tailored to the needs of its constituencies and region. Local NCTC policies are reviewed by relevant committees and employee groups (such as the shared governance council and Student Senate as appropriate) and finalized by the President's Council of

administrators.

The college President is given authorization through the Board of Trustees and the Minnesota state Chancellor to ensure the fiscal integrity of NCTC and the execution of its policies and procedures. The Board selects and hires a Chancellor as CEO for the Minnesota State System and hires the President for each college. The NCTC President is appointed to a three-year contract, and the President works closely with the Chancellor's office in operating the college and maintaining control of the various processes. The Chancellor conducts a performance evaluation of the President, which includes a 360 degree evaluation and an analysis of a complex matrix of data points that speak to the health of the college under the President's direction.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

2.B - Core Component 2.B

The institution presents itself clearly and completely to its students and to the public with regard to its programs, requirements, faculty and staff, costs to students, control, and accreditation relationships.

Rating

Met

Evidence

NCTC's website provides a comprehensive collection of materials that illustrate how the college presents itself clearly and completely to students and the public. The website and the college catalog explain all educational programs and their requirements, contact information for faculty and staff, tuition and fees structures, and a listing of regional and programmatic accreditation relationships.

The college website also provides multiple pages devoted to the college president and the administrative team. However, neither the website nor other published materials mention or identify the 15-member Board of Trustees or the office of the state Chancellor, which are integral to the control of the college. NCTC is encouraged to be more transparent with regard to how state control of the college is structured.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

2.C - Core Component 2.C

The governing board of the institution is sufficiently autonomous to make decisions in the best interest of the institution and to assure its integrity.

1. The governing board's deliberations reflect priorities to preserve and enhance the institution.
2. The governing board reviews and considers the reasonable and relevant interests of the institution's internal and external constituencies during its decision-making deliberations.
3. The governing board preserves its independence from undue influence on the part of donors, elected officials, ownership interests or other external parties when such influence would not be in the best interest of the institution.
4. The governing board delegates day-to-day management of the institution to the administration and expects the faculty to oversee academic matters.

Rating

Met

Evidence

NCTC is governed by the 15-member Minnesota State Board of Trustees appointed by the Governor. The Board has the general authority to govern the state colleges and universities and all related property. The composition of the Board includes three student members, one from a Minnesota community college, one from a state technical college, and one from a state university. The power of the Board's oversight is granted through Minnesota Statute 136F.06.

The Trustees must also comply with Minnesota State Policy 1C.1 Board of Trustees Code of Conduct which prohibits the use of the position to secure personal benefits, to disclose confidential communications or to exert influence in hiring or awarding contracts and must disclose potential conflicts of interest. All meetings of the board comply with the Minnesota Open Meeting Law.

As referenced in the Assurance Argument, Minnesota Statute 136F.07 each college or university shall have a president appointed by the board upon recommendation of the chancellor. Policy 4.2 part one provides: The president is the chief executive officer of the college or university. The president shall report to the chancellor and is responsible for leading the college and/or university faculty, staff, and students in developing and implementing the college or university mission, consistent with the board mission and goals. The president is the primary spokesperson for college or university interests and shall consult regularly with students, faculty, staff, and members of the community. The president shall advise the chancellor, the staff of the system office, and the Board of Trustees on matters of system policy as appropriate, and otherwise administer and support all Minnesota State Colleges and Universities policies and programs. The president shall also lead in generating and sustaining the university/college vision as an integral part of the Minnesota State Colleges and Universities system. The duties and responsibilities of the president shall include, but not be limited to, adhering to board policies and system procedures, employing personnel, providing innovative educational leadership, allocating campus resources, and implementing the board's strategic plan.

Minnesota State faculty are represented by a collective bargaining unit and the respective agreement assigns responsibilities for academic matters to the faculty. Faculty at the colleges are represented by the Minnesota State College Faculty (MSCF). The MSCF Master Agreement 2017-2019, Article 8: Shared Governance and Academic Affairs, assures that faculty are central to academic decision-making through an Academic Affairs and Standards Council.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

2.D - Core Component 2.D

The institution is committed to freedom of expression and the pursuit of truth in teaching and learning.

Rating

Met

Evidence

The Master Agreement for the Minnesota State College Faculty contract stipulates that faculty "shall maintain and encourage full freedom, within the law, of inquiry, teaching and research," and also identifies that faculty have control over selection of teaching materials. Faculty are afforded the right to choose such teaching materials and methods specific to their courses while still assuring that the course objectives are met, as identified in the official Course Outline for a course.

NCTC's "Student Rights and Responsibilities" policy assures that students and student organizations are "free to examine and to discuss all questions of interest to them and to express opinions publicly and privately." Students are further "free to take reasoned exception to the data or views offered in any course of study and to reserve judgment about matters of opinion."

NCTC's Institutional Learning Outcome #4 is an example of how the college has embedded the pursuit of truth in learning; the official grading rubric for this ILO includes the criterion "Use information effectively, ethically, and legally to accomplish a specific purpose."

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

2.E - Core Component 2.E

The institution's policies and procedures call for responsible acquisition, discovery and application of knowledge by its faculty, students and staff.

1. The institution provides effective oversight and support services to ensure the integrity of research and scholarly practice conducted by its faculty, staff, and students.
2. Students are offered guidance in the ethical use of information resources.
3. The institution has and enforces policies on academic honesty and integrity.

Rating

Met

Evidence

In 2010, NCTC created an Institutional Review Board policy and procedure that outlines the use of human subjects in research, coursework, or other relevant situations. The IRB consists of five faculty members, an administrator, and two outside members, some of whom have received recent training in ethical research.

General education coursework includes instruction to students in the ethical use of researched materials. Institutional Learning Outcome #4 specifically addresses and evaluates a student's integration and appropriate use of information in the learning environment.

NCTC students are bound by college policies defining academic integrity, following copyright laws, intellectual property, student codes of conduct, and student rights and responsibilities. Consequences for students not following these policies and guidelines range from lowering or losing points for assignments to dismissal from the college, depending on the severity of the situation. In situations of academic dishonesty, faculty enter each instance of breaking this policy into an electronic database that tracks each student's record. Since this electronic process was begun in 2016, no case of student misconduct has risen to the level of requiring administrative involvement; faculty have managed such offenses within the classroom environment. The Provost's office monitors the database of student misconduct, and would, if the need arises, meet with the Vice-President of Student Services and the offending student(s) to determine appropriate sanctions against the student(s).

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

2.S - Criterion 2 - Summary

The institution acts with integrity; its conduct is ethical and responsible.

Evidence

The Minnesota State System is unique among state systems in how state colleges are tightly controlled. This control includes a 15-member state Board of Trustees that governs all state colleges and universities. The state system mandates many institutional policies that help to assure integrity and provides for ethical guidelines for teaching, learning, and operating the institution. NCTC is transparent in its policies and practices, and it follows ethical principles in all areas of its operations.

3 - Teaching and Learning: Quality, Resources, and Support

The institution provides high quality education, wherever and however its offerings are delivered.

3.A - Core Component 3.A

The institution's degree programs are appropriate to higher education.

1. Courses and programs are current and require levels of performance by students appropriate to the degree or certificate awarded.
2. The institution articulates and differentiates learning goals for undergraduate, graduate, post-baccalaureate, post-graduate, and certificate programs.
3. The institution's program quality and learning goals are consistent across all modes of delivery and all locations (on the main campus, at additional locations, by distance delivery, as dual credit, through contractual or consortial arrangements, or any other modality).

Rating

Met

Evidence

NCTC offers over 80 degree, diploma, and certificate programs of study. Many of these are "stacked" so that a student can earn a certificate, diploma, or associate degree. Both the assurance argument and discussion with Advisory Committee representatives from business and industry, as well as the East Grand Forks Chamber of Commerce and East Grand Forks Economic Development, confirm programs are relevant to the needs and demands of current employers. The same is true for courses and programs preparing students for transfer to four-year institutions.

NCTC adheres to Minnesota State System Procedure 3.36.1 in the creation of academic programs. Certificate programs as short in length, from 9-30 credits, and able are to be completed in one year or less. Programs of this nature can consist of entirely technical-related course work. They may be shorter than nine credits, or longer than 30 credits when required by an employer, a licensing body, or other regulatory agency, accrediting association, or board. Diploma programs consist of at least 30 credits, of which at least 24 must be in the occupational or technical field of study. These can typically be completed within two years of full-time study. Associate of Applied Science (AAS) degrees consist of 60 credits, of which at least 15 credits must be from the Minnesota Transfer Curriculum (MNTC), and include at least three of the ten MNTC goal areas. AAS degrees may request a waiver to exceed 60 credits when required by industry. Associate of Science (AS) degree consists of at least 30 credits from the MNTC, and include at least six of the ten goal areas. AS degrees may also exceed 60 credits if a waiver based on industry standards is granted. Finally, the Associate of Arts degree must contain at least 40 credits of MNTC and cover all ten goal areas.

Each program maintains program learner outcomes on the NCTC webpage. In addition, NCTC has

five Institutional Learner Outcomes (ILOs) reflecting the expected learning of all graduates. Course learning outcomes are mapped to program learning outcomes, and program learning outcomes are mapped to the ILOs.

The team reviewed approximately 50 syllabi from seven different disciplines, including face-to-face, online, and concurrent (dual-credit) enrollment offerings. While course learning outcomes and other pertinent information was consistent in all syllabi, the team did note considerable visual and organizational variation in the syllabi. It may be beneficial to student understanding and consistency if all syllabi adhere to a common template.

The team uncovered discrepancies in three policies that NCTC should correct.

> 1. Policy 3060 states the instructor must provide students with a copy of syllabus within one week of the start of classes. The faculty handbook (p 13) states faculty must provide a syllabus on the first day of class.

> 2. Policy 3350 defines a credit as one hour of class time per credit (with 2 prep hours), yet in practice, an hour is defined as 50 minutes. The college should consider examples referencing the Carnegie Unit, such as the link below from a fellow Minnesota State institution:

> https://www.winona.edu/registrar/Media/Instruction_and_credit_Equivalencies_chart_20130411.pdf

> 3. Policy 3330 requires advisory committee meetings once per term, not including the summer. Interviews with advisory committee members confirm meetings are scheduled twice per year. Evidence in the form of advisory committee minutes is sporadic. NCTC should strengthen the effort to collect and post minutes from advisory committees.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

3.B - Core Component 3.B

The institution demonstrates that the exercise of intellectual inquiry and the acquisition, application, and integration of broad learning and skills are integral to its educational programs.

1. The general education program is appropriate to the mission, educational offerings, and degree levels of the institution.
2. The institution articulates the purposes, content, and intended learning outcomes of its undergraduate general education requirements. The program of general education is grounded in a philosophy or framework developed by the institution or adopted from an established framework. It imparts broad knowledge and intellectual concepts to students and develops skills and attitudes that the institution believes every college-educated person should possess.
3. Every degree program offered by the institution engages students in collecting, analyzing, and communicating information; in mastering modes of inquiry or creative work; and in developing skills adaptable to changing environments.
4. The education offered by the institution recognizes the human and cultural diversity of the world in which students live and work.
5. The faculty and students contribute to scholarship, creative work, and the discovery of knowledge to the extent appropriate to their programs and the institution's mission.

Rating

Met

Evidence

At NCTC the terms "General Education" and "Liberal Arts" are synonymous.   Minnesota State Procedure 3.36.1 defines General Education as "a cohesive curriculum defined by system college or university faculty to develop general knowledge and reasoning ability through an integration of learning experiences in the liberal arts and sciences" (Subpart T), and includes the Minnesota Transfer Curriculum (Subpart X). It is the responsibility of the Academic Affairs & Standards Council (AASC) to ensure NCTC transfer courses include appropriate and sufficient general education goal areas. Team interviews with AASC indicate there are numerous checks and balances to ensure compliance with this requirement.

NCTC uses a stepped approach to mapping and assessing ILOs. All Certificate and Diploma Programs of 20-45 credits must assess ILO 1: Communication; ILO 2: Critical Thinking, and at least one additional ILO (either ILO 3: Social Engagement; ILO 4: Information and Applied Technology; or ILO 5: Personal Development). Diploma programs of 45-59 credits in length must assess four ILOs, including ILO 1 and ILO 2. All diploma programs of 60 or more credits, and all degree programs assess all five ILOs.

Many technical programs provide students with internships and other hands-on application of the knowledge they acquire through the program's curriculum. It is worth repeating that all associate's degree graduates are also required to complete at least eight hours of service learning during their NCTC experience.

Goals 7 and 8 of the Minnesota Transfer Curriculum address human diversity and the global perspective, and NCTC's ILO 3 emphasizes Social Engagement. The Annual Assessment Report includes some ILO 3 data and minimal analysis. The College should expand dissemination, discussion, and action planning based on this data. See 4.B for further discussion of assessment of student learning. Apart from mentioning this in the assurance argument, the team found surprisingly little evidence of deliberate effort to engage with and celebrate the diversity in the campus and local communities. NCTC should further explore opportunities to highlight the customs, traditions, food, and cultures of their diverse populations.

Faculty and students have opportunities to contribute to scholarship, creative works, and novel ways to discover knowledge. Over the last nine years, NCTC has supported an average of more than three faculty sabbaticals per year. Through this support, faculty have the opportunity to contribute to disciplinary scholarship as well as the scholarship of teaching and learning. Faculty have access to continue their own education through Minnesota State universities at no cost. There is also a professional development fund available on each campus.

Some student clubs and organizations offer field trips that extend their learning beyond the classroom. Many students enjoy clinical and internship experiences, simulations, and other opportunities to enhance their education.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

3.C - Core Component 3.C

The institution has the faculty and staff needed for effective, high-quality programs and student services.

1. The institution has sufficient numbers and continuity of faculty members to carry out both the classroom and the non-classroom roles of faculty, including oversight of the curriculum and expectations for student performance; establishment of academic credentials for instructional staff; involvement in assessment of student learning.
2. All instructors are appropriately qualified, including those in dual credit, contractual, and consortial programs.
3. Instructors are evaluated regularly in accordance with established institutional policies and procedures.
4. The institution has processes and resources for assuring that instructors are current in their disciplines and adept in their teaching roles; it supports their professional development.
5. Instructors are accessible for student inquiry.
6. Staff members providing student support services, such as tutoring, financial aid advising, academic advising, and co-curricular activities, are appropriately qualified, trained, and supported in their professional development.

Rating

Met

Evidence

NCTC has an impressive number of faculty. The student to faculty ratio is 17:1, lower than the average of Minnesota two-year institutions. The visiting team selected and confirmed credentials for a random sample of 30 faculty, including full and part-time, in a variety of locations and delivery modes. All faculty had appropriate credentials for their disciplines.

Faculty and staff expressed satisfaction in the support and resources available to do their jobs as well as to continue their own professional development. They consistently reported appropriate levels of training, citing examples such as training with the learning management system and accessing data reports. They further expressed confidence in the level of support and resources moving forward.

NCTC has an extensive committee structure providing numerous opportunities for faculty involvement in governance, curriculum oversight, assessment, planning, safety and other key aspects of the institution. Faculty reported satisfaction with the number of, and their representation on, college committees.

Students reported satisfaction with availability of faculty, staff, and services to support their learning. They relayed multiple positive stories about student life and faculty club advisors, which supports statements in the assurance argument about NCTC's strong engagement results from the CCSSE.

NCTC adheres to Procedure 4030P regarding faculty performance evaluation. The supervising dean observes faculty members every semester in the classroom while they are in their probationary period and every three years after the three-year probationary period has ended. In addition, NCTC uses Professional Development Plans (PDP) to help assure faculty remain current in their disciplines as well as in teaching and learning. Faculty Professional Development Coordinators are available to support their colleagues in development and execution of the PDP.

The Minnesota Online Quality Initiative (MOQI) uses Quality Matters as a tool to ensure quality of online courses. 28 NCTC courses are currently QM certified. Fifty-three faculty have attended training on Improving Your Online Course or Applying the Quality Matters Rubric Workshop. The College currently has six QM Peer Reviewers and four QM Master Reviewers.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

3.D - Core Component 3.D

The institution provides support for student learning and effective teaching.

1. The institution provides student support services suited to the needs of its student populations.
2. The institution provides for learning support and preparatory instruction to address the academic needs of its students. It has a process for directing entering students to courses and programs for which the students are adequately prepared.
3. The institution provides academic advising suited to its programs and the needs of its students.
4. The institution provides to students and instructors the infrastructure and resources necessary to support effective teaching and learning (technological infrastructure, scientific laboratories, libraries, performance spaces, clinical practice sites, museum collections, as appropriate to the institution's offerings).
5. The institution provides to students guidance in the effective use of research and information resources.

Rating

Met

Evidence

NCTC maintains a user-friendly website that provides access to a host of traditional support services. Each campus provides an appropriate suite of student services including advisors, counselors, financial aid, Veterans affairs, student life, accommodation specialists, testing and tutoring centers, a computer lab, library, printing services, walk-in technology support, and food service. The College also employs video phone technology to provide advising support for students regardless of location. Through a Minnesota State system contract, all students have access to 15 hours of free online tutoring per semester.

Policy 3340 provides students with appropriate opportunities to demonstrate adequate preparation for course and program placement. In particular, ACT, SAT, and MCA (Minnesota Comprehensive Assessment) scores are identified for course placement into college level English and Math courses. Students who do not place into college ready courses through these mechanisms take the Accuplacer assessment and are placed into appropriate developmental or college-level courses. NCTC is currently developing strategies to incorporate multiple measures for course and program placement.

Guided by Policy 2035, qualified students receive disability services through the Academic Success Center (ASC). The ASC Director and Access Specialist work to determine appropriate accommodations, and assure students receive appropriate support. The ASC provides a variety of assistive technologies, such as access to Kurzweil, large-print keyboards, and Dragon. The ASC also includes three quiet rooms at the East Grand Forks Campus and five on the Thief River Falls Campus for students with accommodations to complete testing.

NCTC links a student affairs advisor to students by program. This model ensures opportunities for advisors and advisees to meet to discuss progress and success in the program. Students must get a

code from their advisor every term in order to register for classes. In addition program directors and faculty advisors support students enrolled in their respective technical programs. Faculty advisors serve students in the role of advising on matters pertinent to the field of study and employment options and leads. Faculty members also review Degree Audit Reports with students to monitor progress.

NCTC provides an impressive array of technology to support faculty and students. Wireless access is widely available. There are dedicated computer labs and computers in the library. Classrooms have smart boards, large-screen monitors, computer projectors, or some combination of these technologies. Printers are strategically placed throughout the buildings.

Other innovative technologies include a virtual dissection table in the Anatomy and Physiology laboratory on the East Grand Forks campus, microscope cameras with HDTVs in biology labs, digital image equipment in the radiologic technology lab, a Pyxis automated medication dispenser, and a simulation lab including adult, junior, and baby simulation manikins. The Thief River Falls campus provided similar labs and mobile electronic simulators, robots, and drones.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

3.E - Core Component 3.E

The institution fulfills the claims it makes for an enriched educational environment.

1. Co-curricular programs are suited to the institution's mission and contribute to the educational experience of its students.
2. The institution demonstrates any claims it makes about contributions to its students' educational experience by virtue of aspects of its mission, such as research, community engagement, service learning, religious or spiritual purpose, and economic development.

Rating

Met

Evidence

The College differentiates between co-curricular and extracurricular activities: co-curricular are required, non-credit experiences, while extracurricular are optional activities that enhance the overall student experience. The College only defines student learning outcomes for co-curricular activities. Currently the only recognized co-curricular activity is the service learning requirement for all associate-degree-seeking students. It is appropriate for NCTC to consider defining learning outcomes of other co-curricular services, such as advising and financial aid, that support student learning.

Several extracurricular student clubs and organizations are available, particularly related to technical fields. Student Life manages the process for a student or employee to organize a new student club.

The Thief River Falls campus is home to intercollegiate athletic teams for volleyball, baseball, basketball, softball, football, wrestling, and clay target.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

3.S - Criterion 3 - Summary

The institution provides high quality education, wherever and however its offerings are delivered.

Evidence

NCTC offers appropriate and current programs to meet student and employer needs. NCTC offers over 80 degree, diploma, and certificate programs of study, many of which are stackable to facilitate additional education throughout one's working career. Programs adhere to Minnesota State System Procedure 3.36.1 regarding inclusion of general education credits and minimum credit hour composition for certificates, diplomas, and degrees. Faculty create and post program learning outcomes on the NCTC webpage. Learning outcomes are mapped from course to program, and program to institution. NCTC should work to deliberately measure learning at the program outcome level and use the data to guide learning improvements.

NCTC students have opportunities to contribute to scholarship and creative works through a variety of clubs and organizations. NCTC provides faculty with sabbatical opportunities and a professional development fund. In addition faculty can continue their own learning through the Minnesota State system at no cost.

NCTC has sufficient numbers of faculty to complete classroom and non-classroom responsibilities. Faculty expressed satisfaction in administrative support they receive as well as in opportunities to participate in governance, curriculum oversight, assessment, planning, safety and other key aspects of operation. The visiting team confirmed appropriate credentials for a random sample of 30 faculty, including full and part-time, in a variety of locations and delivery modes.

Each NCTC campus provides a variety of student services including advisors, counselors, financial aid, Veterans affairs, student life, accommodation specialists, testing and tutoring centers, a computer lab, library, printing services, walk-in technology support, and food service. The Academic Success Center coordinates disability services for qualified students. NCTC supports student learning with both a student affairs advisor and faculty advisor. NCTC has impressive technology to support learning both in and outside the classroom. Students expressed satisfaction in availability of support services and access to faculty.

NCTC provides both co-curricular and extracurricular activities to enhance the student experience. The College should consider defining learning outcomes for other co-curricular services that support student learning.

4 - Teaching and Learning: Evaluation and Improvement

The institution demonstrates responsibility for the quality of its educational programs, learning environments, and support services, and it evaluates their effectiveness for student learning through processes designed to promote continuous improvement.

4.A - Core Component 4.A

The institution demonstrates responsibility for the quality of its educational programs.

1. The institution maintains a practice of regular program reviews.
2. The institution evaluates all the credit that it transcripts, including what it awards for experiential learning or other forms of prior learning, or relies on the evaluation of responsible third parties.
3. The institution has policies that assure the quality of the credit it accepts in transfer.
4. The institution maintains and exercises authority over the prerequisites for courses, rigor of courses, expectations for student learning, access to learning resources, and faculty qualifications for all its programs, including dual credit programs. It assures that its dual credit courses or programs for high school students are equivalent in learning outcomes and levels of achievement to its higher education curriculum.
5. The institution maintains specialized accreditation for its programs as appropriate to its educational purposes.
6. The institution evaluates the success of its graduates. The institution assures that the degree or certificate programs it represents as preparation for advanced study or employment accomplish these purposes. For all programs, the institution looks to indicators it deems appropriate to its mission, such as employment rates, admission rates to advanced degree programs, and participation rates in fellowships, internships, and special programs (e.g., Peace Corps and Americorps).

Rating

Met

Evidence

NCTC's Comprehensive Program Review Form is a tool that invites faculty to fully assess programmatic outcomes. The program review process focuses on six areas: program alignment and overview, efficiency, students (learning), curriculum, resources & support, and community. Each program is reviewed every five years. Program review is mandated by state policy and by institution policy. The program reviews are used to determine viability or sustainability of academic programs, to ensure that programs are meeting business/industry and/or transfer needs, and to assure quality instruction. On occasion, the results of program reviews have led to discontinuation of an academic program or re-tailoring a program to better meet the needs of its constituents.

In addition to the five-year program review, each program also submits an annual program assessment, collecting data that measure the achievement of course and program outcomes. Specific programmatic goals and learning outcomes are listed, complete with measures used to determine the level of achievement of the outcomes. Most of the technical programs rely heavily on exit exams or nationally-normed tests to determine program effectiveness, as well as other indirect measures of program completion and graduation rates, job placement, and employer surveys. While these measures are valuable, more direct measures of achieving specific programmatic goals would create a stronger assessment process. Heavy reliance on the nationally-normed tests does not necessarily create meaningful data for faculty to understand how the curriculum shapes the learning experience of students, nor does it inform faculty as to how best to make changes to curriculum and instruction to increase pass rates on such tests. In interviews, some faculty expressed concern about how seriously their students were taking such tests, further casting suspicion upon the quality and the usefulness of these test scores. The faculty is encouraged to use assessment tools that are more fully embedded into the curriculum and that will glean more specific and direct measures of student attainment of learning outcomes, both at the course and programmatic levels.

The awarding of prior learning and the transfer of credits from other institutions are governed by solid institutional policies and statewide governance structures for transfer. NCTC also accepts credit by examination, using a large number of testing mechanisms.

The Accountability Dashboard is a summary of data and graphs detailing how well various student and institutional data compare to established goals. NCTC regularly meets or exceeds its goals in a multitude of areas, including licensure pass rates, enrollment and success of students of diverse populations, graduation and employment rates, and use of resources.

Sample syllabi were reviewed to ensure consistency of outcomes, purpose, and rigor across various teaching modalities and locations. Most syllabi reviewed maintained consistency; however, a handful of outliers would indicate that the college can monitor and evaluate these consistencies more effectively.

Concurrent enrollment (dual credit or high school enrollment) courses are offered both through NCTC's partnerships with local high schools and through the Online College in the High School (OCHS) Program, a regional consortium of institutions who provide online courses to participating institutions throughout the state. The OCHS program courses instructors are the same ones teaching within the college's regular delivery method and hold appropriate credentials for courses taught. In the "College in High School (CHS) courses taught by high school faculty courses are taught using the same syllabi and course outlines used in the institution.

Fifteen technical degree programs have received programmatic accreditation or programmatic approval through their respective accreditation or governing bodies. A review of accreditation notifications verify that all fifteen programs are in compliance with accreditation or approval standards.

The institution has defined programmatic outcomes which have been aligned to one or more of the five Institutional Learning Outcomes. Faculty also create curriculum maps to further align institutional outcomes to programmatic outcomes to course outcomes. A review of sample curriculum maps verify this alignment in several programs; however, other curriculum maps do not appear to directly align course outcomes to institutional outcomes. For example, in the welding program's curriculum map, the course unit outcome "Students will correctly weld project" (sic) has been aligned to the institutional outcome "Students will be able to communicate effectively . . . ." Academic

personnel may want to review the wording of student learning outcomes at all levels, as well as the curriculum maps, to ensure that alignment is logical and that achievement of the outcomes is possible and measurable.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

4.B - Core Component 4.B

The institution demonstrates a commitment to educational achievement and improvement through ongoing assessment of student learning.

1. The institution has clearly stated goals for student learning and effective processes for assessment of student learning and achievement of learning goals.
2. The institution assesses achievement of the learning outcomes that it claims for its curricular and co-curricular programs.
3. The institution uses the information gained from assessment to improve student learning.
4. The institution's processes and methodologies to assess student learning reflect good practice, including the substantial participation of faculty and other instructional staff members.

Rating

Met With Concerns

Evidence

One recent promising improvement in assessment is that NCTC compiles an annual Assessment Report that focuses primarily on academic assessment and also includes data related to student surveys and student services assessment. The report also includes analyses and observations of overall trends and patterns at the college. The 2018-2019 Assessment Report provides a brief analysis of two of the five Institutional Learning Outcomes which was assessed in the previous year, as well as a summary of the annual programmatic assessments. Graduation placement rates are included in a table, and summaries of the SENSE and CCSSE survey tools include brief analyses of the results. Some graduate exit surveys and other lesser assessment vehicles are also briefly mentioned. The document is an attempt to summarize and catalogue various college-wide assessment tools, but two crucial missing pieces of the report are a detailed analysis of the results and identification of how the data can be used for continuous improvement across the institution. This lack of data analysis and use is consistent across the institution and is a tremendous growth opportunity for NCTC.

Currently, career and technical programs at NCTC are primarily assessed through indirect measures such as surveys, graduation/transfer rates, placement rates, and nationally-normed licensure exams. While graduation/transfer rates and job placement rates can provide some useful data regarding the viability of a degree program, they generally are weak indicators of student attainment of programmatic learning outcomes. More direct assessment measures of student learning outcomes would provide more usable data. For example, in the carpentry program, one of the programmatic outcomes is demonstrating framing skills, and another is reading blueprints. Those two outcomes could be assessed in one activity, neither of which would be directly assessed with the NOCTI test as a whole. However, questions could be mapped to specific outcomes. Developing these kinds of direct assessment measures would yield more robust assessment data to guide improvement in the teaching and learning of the discipline. It is usually necessary to tease apart the student learning outcomes in any given activity that is used for assessment purposes and measure each outcome with a specific instrument, rubric, or tool.

The five-year comprehensive program review form appears to be a viable assessment tool for the success and sustainability of a program's goal of producing an employable workforce. The program review form also invites faculty to draw connections between assessment data and resource (budget) requests and planning initiatives, although it is unclear from the form or from conversations with personnel how effective this mechanism is at feeding the college's strategic plan and budget.

The Liberal Arts program is assessed through the "assessment plan" and the "effectiveness report." The evidence provided by the institution to illustrate the assessment plan includes a detailed table of program learner outcomes, assessment measures, and performance targets, coupled with resulting data for the period being assessed. The table also invites faculty to draw comparisons to previous semesters and to identify action plans to take as a result of the data. The document itself has the potential of capturing assessment data and action plans that can then inform planning and budgeting, although there is not currently evidence to suggest this connection is happening. Some of the assessment plans reviewed by the team do not appear to draw explicitly logical connections between the assessment artifact and the learning objective. Other liberal arts program assessment plans (chemistry, for example) are more explicit in how artifacts are used to measure outcomes. The institution is encouraged to incorporate into their HLC Assessment Academy work a thorough examination of what artifacts are used to directly measure the PLOs and ILOs as they are stated and to also consider ways of allowing faculty to norm their home-grown rubrics to provide more consistent and comparable data.

As NCTC develops its assessment processes, those processes should be applied consistently to all modalities and locations. Currently, no assessment data are collected from courses taught through the Distance Minnesota consortium by faculty from other institutions.

NCTC is currently engaged with the HLC Assessment Academy, and the initial steps of that work have involved the rewording of two of the five ILOs which had previously been problematic to understand and assess; the other three will be revised in the coming year. The Assessment Academy work will focus on "revising [the] comprehensive assessment plan." Additionally, personnel involved in the work of the Academy identified the need to more accurately and consistently map programmatic outcomes to institutional and course outcomes, as well as developing stronger co-curricular assessment processes.

The institution might benefit from the use of common terminology related to assessment to aid the institution in meeting the expectations of assessment of student learning outcomes.

Some co-curricular student services are assessed through the SENSE and CCSSE surveys. Perhaps more attention should be placed on these offices and services in how they impact student learning and how they can be more directly assessed.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

NCTC needs to continue building its assessment process to include a more detailed analysis of the assessment data collected and to identify decisions and changes to curriculum and/or the teaching and learning process in order to improve student attainment of student learning outcomes. This final piece of the assessment process (closing the assessment loop) is integral to the success of assessment efforts.

Monitoring related to Core Component 4.B is specified in the Review Summary at the end of this

report. NCTC should, through the monitoring, provide evidence that illustrates how the assessment data being collected is being analyzed and used to make improvements. The college also should provide evidence that the results of the assessment process informs strategic planning and budgeting initiatives. This concern is tied directly to the concerns mentioned in 5D.

4.C - Core Component 4.C

The institution demonstrates a commitment to educational improvement through ongoing attention to retention, persistence, and completion rates in its degree and certificate programs.

1. The institution has defined goals for student retention, persistence, and completion that are ambitious but attainable and appropriate to its mission, student populations, and educational offerings.
2. The institution collects and analyzes information on student retention, persistence, and completion of its programs.
3. The institution uses information on student retention, persistence, and completion of programs to make improvements as warranted by the data.
4. The institution's processes and methodologies for collecting and analyzing information on student retention, persistence, and completion of programs reflect good practice. (Institutions are not required to use IPEDS definitions in their determination of persistence or completion rates. Institutions are encouraged to choose measures that are suitable to their student populations, but institutions are accountable for the validity of their measures.)

Rating

Met

Evidence

NCTC defines goals for student retention and completion as part of the Minnesota State Strategic Performance Measures system. These indicators regularly place NCTC at or above its goals for retention and completion (although the last year reported saw a decline in retention and persistence), and the system is able to track Minnesota students across the state system. To help increase these rates, NCTC has initiated mandatory registration access code practice and targeted advising. College personnel were not able to articulate how successful these changes have been in increasing these rates, and this is once again an opportunity for the college to gather and analyze data and to use the data to make more directed improvements to its efforts.

NCTC identified student enrollment, retention, and completion in its recent HLC open pathways quality initiative project, which concluded in 2018. The results of this project include more intrusive advising; calling on advisees who had not yet registered for the upcoming term; a newly-restructured full-time position of Director of Enrollment Management and Admissions; the resurrection of in-person, on-campus orientation sessions; and a 5% decrease in students placed on academic warning, suspension, or probation over a 5-year period. From FY13 to FY16, completion rates increased 4.7%, but persistence rates remain stagnant.

NCTC does identify goals for retention, persistence, and completion, and the institution has employed many efforts to meet these goals. Some of these efforts have been more successful than others, but data is being generated and used in the college's efforts to increase these rates.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

4.S - Criterion 4 - Summary

The institution demonstrates responsibility for the quality of its educational programs, learning environments, and support services, and it evaluates their effectiveness for student learning through processes designed to promote continuous improvement.

Evidence

The Minnesota state system requires the college to identify goals for admission, retention, and completing rates, and the college monitors graduation and employment placement rates and surveys students and employees to provide additional data.

NCTC has begun a strong process of assessing student learning outcomes with clearly identified Institutional Learning Outcomes which are assessed within programmatic assessment efforts. The college produces a large amount of data, but little evidence exists to indicate how the data are used. The college will need to complete the entire assessment cycle, which should include thorough analysis of assessment data and use of the data that subsequently informs planning and budgeting initiatives as well as improvement to teaching and learning.

The college should also include both direct and indirect measures in assessing student learning and other assessment processes. This concern is tied directly to the concerns mentioned in 5D. The comprehensive review team is recommending a focused visit in four years, and in that visit, evidence should be provided that illustrates how the assessment data being collected is being analyzed and used to make improvements.

5 - Resources, Planning, and Institutional Effectiveness

The institution's resources, structures, and processes are sufficient to fulfill its mission, improve the quality of its educational offerings, and respond to future challenges and opportunities. The institution plans for the future.

5.A - Core Component 5.A

The institution's resource base supports its current educational programs and its plans for maintaining and strengthening their quality in the future.

1. The institution has the fiscal and human resources and physical and technological infrastructure sufficient to support its operations wherever and however programs are delivered.
2. The institution's resource allocation process ensures that its educational purposes are not adversely affected by elective resource allocations to other areas or disbursement of revenue to a superordinate entity.
3. The goals incorporated into mission statements or elaborations of mission statements are realistic in light of the institution's organization, resources, and opportunities.
4. The institution's staff in all areas are appropriately qualified and trained.
5. The institution has a well-developed process in place for budgeting and for monitoring expense.

Rating

Met

Evidence

In the assurance argument, NCTC indicates that Minnesota's state policy gives guidance to the purpose of reserves as follows:
1) protect the system and individual institution in case of sudden shortfall,
2) to cover unanticipated expenses, and
3) to provide extraordinary one-time investments.

NCTC, while unable to fully cover depreciation over past several years, has maintained the 7% reserve recommended by the Minnesota State System and a healthy cash fund balance of 39% in 2018. The Assurance Argument and information gathered in campus meetings during the visit indicate that NCTC reserved 7% in FY18 and FY17, and the CFI (excluding GASB 68 & 75) was 2.70 in 2018 and 1.92 in 2017. The College has two sources of revenue: state appropriations and student tuition, both determined at the state system level. Between 2010 and 2018, the College experienced an 18% decrease in enrollment. The college's tuition remained at $165 per credit hour from 2013-2019 and in 2017 it dropped to $163.35 for the year. Online tuition rate is $199 per credit hour.

Faculty and staff compensation increases are set after appropriations and are determined at the Minnesota state system level through collective bargaining negotiations. NCTC's share of state appropriations has decreased from 2.34% in 2011 to 1.99% in 2019 because of enrollment decline.

Human Resources reports that employees have decreased from 254 in 2015 to 234 in 2019. This has helped to offset declining revenues. The College indicates that although they have decreased numbers, needs are still met. Steps to reduce costs have been implemented, including vacated positions not being replaced, leasing of unused space, sale of the vehicle fleet, changes in bookstore operations, and dining services being outsourced.

The college supports two campuses, the Aerospace location, and a satellite location in Roseau. The Information Technology Services Department provides support for each of these and has a physical presence at both campuses. Northwest Education Technology Systems (NCTS) is responsible for maintenance and operations of regional data and video conferencing infrastructure. For online courses, the College partners with Distance Minnesota to provide learning and support for online learners and staff. The College has a regular plan and cycle for upgrading and replacing equipment and infrastructure. Surveys collect feedback in these areas and are part of the annual assessment report.

NCTC actively either adds to fund balance each year or uses this funding for planned investments, capital improvements, the creation or redevelopment of programs such as Occupational Therapy labs, expansion of the fitness center in which the fund provided $581,000 and student fundraising provided $169,000. The College foundation helps by providing student scholarships. Based on the Assurance Argument, the College has a structured process for budgeting driven by the Minnesota State System Board of Trustees setting the tuition and fees that includes templates provided by the system office that include: budget instructions, budget template, budget narrative template, and reallocation template. Colleges are expected to meet system deadlines. The College has 6-8 weeks to input budget requests. Submissions are then reviewed by each department and then the prioritized list is vetted and funded by administration through priority based on the budget availability for the year.

Enrollment has decreased steadily, from 2,938 FYE in FY2010 to 2,201 FYE in FY2018 (28%). Based on information gathered (high school graduation rates), this downward trend is expected to continue for several years. Measures to reduce the decline have included more online offerings and unique programming.

NCTC, while experiencing a reduction in the number of students, has maintained the resources to support the current educational programs through prioritization and efficiencies. The College's resources, structures, and processes are sufficient to fulfill its mission.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

5.B - Core Component 5.B

The institution's governance and administrative structures promote effective leadership and support collaborative processes that enable the institution to fulfill its mission.

1. The governing board is knowledgeable about the institution; it provides oversight of the institution's financial and academic policies and practices and meets its legal and fiduciary responsibilities.
2. The institution has and employs policies and procedures to engage its internal constituencies—including its governing board, administration, faculty, staff, and students—in the institution's governance.
3. Administration, faculty, staff, and students are involved in setting academic requirements, policy, and processes through effective structures for contribution and collaborative effort.

Rating

Met

Evidence

Northland Community and Technical College (NCTC) is part of the Minnesota State System, and the Board of Trustees for that system serves and the college's Board of Trustees as well. The Board serves as the governing body and hires a Chancellor as CEO of the System to assist in the oversight of the 37 state colleges and universities and in the institutions' financial and academic policies and practices. As such, the Board adopts suitable policy for the institutions it governs.

Members of the Board try to visit 1-2 campuses each year, and they also attend some college functions each year, such as commencement. The Board directs decision making regarding development, approval, and management of academic programs at its colleges and universities, and it delegates program approval responsibilities to the Chancellor. The President at each institution has the authority, responsibility, and accountability to administer his/her college or university in accordance with Board policies. NCTC adopts the policies of the Board and has developed and approved others that align with approved policies.

The institutional governance includes standing committees to engage its stakeholders, including Shared Governance and Academic Affairs, Strategic Planning Committee, and Academic Affairs Standards Council, among others The membership of these committees is thoughtful and appears to include members from both the Thief River Falls Campus and the East Grand Forks campus. Examples were provided by administration, faculty, staff, and students regarding how they have been involved in the setting of academic requirements, policy, and processes. Three students, one from the universities, one from the technical colleges and one from the community colleges, are members of the Board of Trustees.

In discussions with personnel on both campuses, it became clear that there is an intentional effort to pull the two campuses together to function as one college. Committees are made up of personnel from both campuses, and in some cases from the additional locations. Some administrators live in each

campus community and all of them have offices on both campuses. It became clear that there is intentionality in the planning for how the campuses work together.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

5.C - Core Component 5.C

The institution engages in systematic and integrated planning.

1. The institution allocates its resources in alignment with its mission and priorities.
2. The institution links its processes for assessment of student learning, evaluation of operations, planning, and budgeting.
3. The planning process encompasses the institution as a whole and considers the perspectives of internal and external constituent groups.
4. The institution plans on the basis of a sound understanding of its current capacity. Institutional plans anticipate the possible impact of fluctuations in the institution's sources of revenue, such as enrollment, the economy, and state support.
5. Institutional planning anticipates emerging factors, such as technology, demographic shifts, and globalization.

Rating

Met

Evidence

NCTC has experienced a decline in funding over the past few years due to a decrease in enrollment and in state allocations. While the College has developed a strategic planning process, the plans often go unfulfilled because of limited funding. Personnel indicated that the College is required by the state to forecast enrollment about a year out. Due to the declining funding, forecasting is critical to prevent unintended consequences. College Administration indicate that the forecast needs to fall within 1% of the actual enrollment which they indicated was very difficult to do accurately to avoid penalties by the state system. To do this forecasting, personnel need a sound understanding of the impact of the forecast and to consider emerging factors and needs of the institution to help determine if cuts will be necessary as a result of limited funding. The College indicated they work hard on getting the forecast as accurate as possible. They indicated they had been fairly successful in this forecasting.

The College has many plans including the Strategic Plan, Facility Master Plan, Academic Affairs Master Plan, and Diversity Plan; however, it is not clear what data as a result of their planning are collected or how they are used. Budget planning involves the institution as a whole and considers the perspectives of both internal and external groups. Examples include the needs of industry for short-term customized training and advisory board suggestions for equipment. Through student input and partially student-generated funding, a fitness center was added on the East Grand Forks campus. It is not clear how the institution links and integrates its processes for evaluation of operations, planning, and budgeting. Additionally, it is not clear how assessment of student learning is linked to either planning or budgeting.

The College is in a region where the population is becoming more diverse, and NCTC has developed a diversity plan that has not yet been fully implemented. This illustrates how the college tries to be sensitive to the needs of their communities. The institution would benefit from a strategic plan that integrates goals and strategies from the other existing plans, such as the diversity plan, academic

master plan, and facility plan, resulting in a strategic plan that is informed by the analysis and use of all the assessment data across the college.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

5.D - Core Component 5.D

The institution works systematically to improve its performance.

1. The institution develops and documents evidence of performance in its operations.
2. The institution learns from its operational experience and applies that learning to improve its institutional effectiveness, capabilities, and sustainability, overall and in its component parts.

Rating

Met With Concerns

Evidence

The College has many plans including the Strategic Plan, Facility Master Plan, Academic Affairs Master Plan, and Diversity Plan; however, it is not clear what internal data are collected as a result of changes or how they are used to improve outcomes. It is also unclear how the institution learns from its operational experiences and applies that learning to improve effectiveness, capabilities, and sustainability. Based on conversations with personnel during the visit, it appears that the college primarily relies on surveys to help guide improvements. While surveys can provide indirect information, more direct measures of the effectiveness of these processes and plans will yield more usable information.

The strategic plan is a three-year rolling document that primarily targets enrollment and retention. The college's many plans mentioned above could be better managed if they all fed into the college-wide strategic plan more deliberately. Moreover, the strategic plan needs to be informed by assessment data and to include more defined budgetary linkages.

Throughout the college's Assurance Argument and during the team's time on campus, no strong evidence was provided to illustrate that the college documents its performance of operations or learns from its operational experiences in efforts to improve its performance.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

The College has many plans including the Strategic Plan, Facility Master Plan, Academic Affairs Master Plan, and Diversity Plan; however, it is not clear what internal data are collected as a result of changes or how that data are used to improve outcomes. It is also unclear how the institution learns from its operational experiences and applies that learning to improve effectiveness, capabilities, and sustainability. Based on conversations with personnel during the visit, it appears the college primarily relies on surveys to help guide improvements. While surveys can provide indirect information, more direct measures of the effectiveness of these processes and plans will yield more usable information.

The strategic plan is a three year rolling document that primarily targets enrollment and retention. The college's many plans mentioned above could be better managed if they all fed into the college-

wide strategic plan more deliberately. Moreover, the strategic plan needs to be informed by assessment data and to include more defined budgetary linkages.

Throughout the college's Assurance Argument and during the team's time on campus, no strong evidence was provided to illustrate that the college documents its performance of operations or learns from its operational experiences in efforts to improve its performance. Evidence of this linkage should be provided during monitoring. Monitoring related to Core Component 5.D is specified in the Review Summary at the end of this report.

5.S - Criterion 5 - Summary

The institution's resources, structures, and processes are sufficient to fulfill its mission, improve the quality of its educational offerings, and respond to future challenges and opportunities. The institution plans for the future.

Evidence

Northland Community and Technical College (NCTC) is part of the Minnesota State System. The Board, Chancellor, and NCTC work together to ensure the structure and processes are in place to fulfill the college's mission.

In recent years NCTC, while experiencing a reduction in the number of students, has maintained the resources to support the current educational programs through prioritization and efficiencies. The College's resources, structures, and processes are sufficient to fulfill its mission.

The College has many plans including the Strategic Plan, Facility Master Plan, Academic Affairs Master Plan, and Diversity Plan; however, it is not clear what data are collected or how they are used. It is also unclear how the institution learns from its operational experiences and applies that learning to improve effectiveness, capabilities, and sustainability. The Strategic plan would be enhanced though stronger linkages to the other plans, assessment, and budgeting.

FC - Federal Compliance

INSTITUTIONS
Download the Federal Compliance Filing Form and Federal Compliance Overview at
hlcommission.org/federal-compliance. After completing the form, combine it with all required
appendices into a single PDF file. Bookmark the appendices in the combined PDF. Upload the PDF
here by clicking the Choose File button below. The Federal Compliance Filing must be uploaded
prior to locking the Assurance Argument.

PEER REVIEWERS
Download the Federal Compliance Overview and Instructions for Peer Reviewers at
hlcommission.org/federal-compliance. The institution's Federal Compliance Filing and supporting
documentation are provided below.

Federal Compliance reviewer: Use the template provided in the Rationale section to enter the
preliminary findings for each component of Federal Compliance. The findings should include one of
the following conclusions for each component as well as a rationale that fully supports the
conclusion:

- The institution meets HLC's requirements.
- The institution meets HLC's requirements, but additional monitoring is recommended.
- The institution does not meet HLC's requirements and additional monitoring is recommended.

If the reviewer recommends monitoring for any Federal Compliance component, provide that
information in the Interim Monitoring section. Describe what improvement is needed as well as how
HLC would determine the institution has resolved the issue. In the Rating field, select the drop-down
option that reflects the reviewer's preliminary findings.

Notify the team chair when the draft evaluation is complete, no later than one week before the team's
on-site visit.

Evaluation team: While conducting the visit, the peer review team determines whether the
preliminary findings made by the Federal Compliance reviewer accurately represent the institution's
compliance with all applicable requirements. If necessary, adjust the rating, preliminary findings and
rationale provided by the Federal Compliance reviewer. All information in the rationale should
explain the findings ultimately selected. Specific instructions addressed directly to the evaluation
team by the Federal Compliance Reviewer should be removed. Ensure that one of the conclusions
listed above is provided for each Federal Compliance component in the Rationale section.

If the team finds that there are substantive issues related to the institution's compliance with the
Criteria for Accreditation, address those issues within the appropriate Core Component sections of
the Review tab.

Rating

Does not require monitoring

Federal Compliance Filing Form

- HLC_Federal_Compliance_Form_Final_with_Appendix_C

Rationale

1. ASSIGNMENT OF CREDITS, PROGRAM LENGTH AND TUITION

Conclusion (Choose one of the following statements and delete the other two.):

The institution meets HLC's requirements.

Rationale:

The institution has provided a policy that is reflective of the standard Carnegie unit of study. The documents provided by Northland Community and Technical College (NCTC) show evidence of dates revised or reviewed.

2. INSTITUTIONAL RECORDS OF STUDENT COMPLAINTS

Conclusion (Choose one of the following statements and delete the other two.):

The institution meets HLC's requirements.

Rationale:

NCTC provided a policy statement that included the date of adoptions and subsequent reviews. The college defined a student complaint and assigned the responsible administrator.

NCTC provided a written record of the complaint procedure. The procedure is a common distribution of student complaints, those of academic and non-academic nature, to be reviewed by the Academic Dean or Dean of Student Affairs. Those complaints outside of that definition are reviewed by the VP for Academic Affairs. The procedure also defines what will be found in the log. The procedure included the date of adoption and subsequent reviews.

The policy and procedures are found on the institution website on the tab "About" and general heading of "Policies & Procedures."

3. PUBLICATION OF TRANSFER POLICIES

Conclusion (Choose one of the following statements and delete the other two.):

The institution meets HLC's requirements.

Rationale:

The college provides prospective and current students a policy on transfer credit. The policy outlines the transfer of institutional credit to other colleges and universities and the acceptance of credit coming into the college from other colleges and universities. The policy reflects standard transfer credit evaluation and reflects relationships at a state-system level and reflects the date of adoption and dates of revision and review.

The college provides individual webpages for each academic program offered. The program page lists the degree or certificate offerings. When a student selects a degree link, the degree is explained and an additional link is provided listing articulation agreements in place for that particular degree offering.

The college provides a webpage dedicated to the "Minnesota Transfer Curriculum." The webpage provides an explanation of the transfer curriculum. Within the transfer curriculum are statewide goal areas. The College lists the courses offered which will meet those goal areas.

4. PRACTICES FOR VERIFICATION OF STUDENT IDENTITY

Conclusion (Choose one of the following statements and delete the other two.):

The institution meets HLC's requirements.

Rationale:

The college is following standard practices for verifying student identity. A student is provided a unique identification number (StarID) and they create a personal password. The student uses this unique combination to access college technology.

5. TITLE IV PROGRAM RESPONSIBILITIES

Conclusion (Choose one of the following statements and delete the other two.):

The institution meets HLC's requirements.

Rationale:

General Program Responsibilities:

The college reports the Title IV program was recertified December 2018 with no provisional conditions. The College reports that it has never had a program review. As a result of this declaration, there were no additional attachments or areas of concern.

Financial Responsibility Requirements:

The college reports that the State of Minnesota submits audits on behalf of the state system of higher education. The college reports that all colleges in Minnesota were subject to heightened cash monitoring due to the implementation of a new accounting system for the State of Minnesota. The college attached a letter releasing them from heightened cash monitoring issued

by the DOE May 2018.

Campus Crime Information, Athletic Participation and Financial Aid, and Related Disclosures:

The VP of Administrative Services and the Safety/Security Coordinator are the individuals charged with the collection and dissemination of campus crime data. The Athletic Director is charged with data on athletic participation and the Financial Aid director is responsible for financial aid data.

The college reports no instances of required investigations or findings. The college publishes the annual crime report and equity in athletics on their website. The published reports are current on the website.

Student Right to Know/Equity in Athletics:

The director of Financial Aid is responsible for publishing the information required for Student Right to Know and the Athletic Director is responsible for Equity in Athletics.

The college reports that they are not the subject of federal investigation in either report. The college provides website access to the required information. The information is current and does not reveal any irregularities.

Satisfactory Academic Progress Policy:

The college publishes the required policy and it meets federal requirements. The college is not the subject of any findings. The colleges publishes the policies on the website on the "About" tab. The policies are current.

6. PUBLICATION OF STUDENT OUTCOME DATA

Conclusion (Choose one of the following statements and delete the other two.):

The institution meets HLC's requirements.

Rationale:

The Institutional Research office maintains a link on the college website "About" tab. On the IR page anyone can quickly find a variety of college reports including the Annual Assessment Report, the bi-annual CCSSE report, information on graduates, HLC reports, bi-annual SENSE reports, a link to Student Right--to-Know, performance measures, peer comparisons, and Satisfaction Survey Results. The college provides brief explanations of the information and a prospective, current, or former student would be able to have a cursory understanding of the college, its' programs, and the ability of its' graduates.

7. STANDING WITH STATE AND OTHER ACCREDITING AGENCIES

Conclusion (Choose one of the following statements and delete the other two.):

The institution meets HLC's requirements.

Rationale:

The college provides a webpage under the tab "About" concerning all specialized accreditation. The Higher Learning is listed first on the webpage. All programs of study which carry program accreditation are listed. The accrediting agency and contact information is provided.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

Review Dashboard

Number	Title	Rating
1	Mission	
1.A	Core Component 1.A	Met
1.B	Core Component 1.B	Met
1.C	Core Component 1.C	Met
1.D	Core Component 1.D	Met
1.S	Criterion 1 - Summary	
2	Integrity: Ethical and Responsible Conduct	
2.A	Core Component 2.A	Met
2.B	Core Component 2.B	Met
2.C	Core Component 2.C	Met
2.D	Core Component 2.D	Met
2.E	Core Component 2.E	Met
2.S	Criterion 2 - Summary	
3	Teaching and Learning: Quality, Resources, and Support	
3.A	Core Component 3.A	Met
3.B	Core Component 3.B	Met
3.C	Core Component 3.C	Met
3.D	Core Component 3.D	Met
3.E	Core Component 3.E	Met
3.S	Criterion 3 - Summary	
4	Teaching and Learning: Evaluation and Improvement	
4.A	Core Component 4.A	Met
4.B	Core Component 4.B	Met With Concerns
4.C	Core Component 4.C	Met
4.S	Criterion 4 - Summary	
5	Resources, Planning, and Institutional Effectiveness	
5.A	Core Component 5.A	Met
5.B	Core Component 5.B	Met
5.C	Core Component 5.C	Met
5.D	Core Component 5.D	Met With Concerns
5.S	Criterion 5 - Summary	
FC	Federal Compliance	Does not require monitoring

Review Summary

Focused Visit(s)

Due Date
9/30/2023

Visit Focus
Visiting Team Recommendation:

After considering the team reflection and work after returning from the visit to NCTC, the team concluded that Core Component 4B and 5D are met with concerns and recommends the institution be placed into the standard pathway which will result in a visit in four years that should include an imbedded focus visit. The team reflection resulted in the insight that the concerns related to 4B and 5D are the result of the same issue, the inability to close the loop.

In that visit, evidence should be provided to the visiting team that includes:

Assessment of Student Learning Processes

1.Details on how the institution uses data gathered from both direct and indirect measure in assessment of student learning.

2. Details showing that measures of student learning are identified and mapped to program outcomes and institutional outcomes.

3. End of Cycle reports showing specific data sets. This will help the institution to develop trend analysis.

4. Documentation that student outcomes are used to develop improvement plans.

5. Documentation that shows assessment plan link to the strategic plan and budget.

.

Other Planning Documents that support the overall strategic plan i.e. Academic, Facilities, Diversity:

1.Details on how the institution uses data gathered from both direct and indirect measure in strategic planning documents.

2. Details on how they are using the abundance of data they already collect for the state system and within their own processes.

3. End of Cycle reports showing specific data sets. This will help the institution to develop trend analysis.

4.Documentation that outcomes from these planning documents are reviewed and used to develop improvement plans and are linked to the budget.

Conclusion

Summary of Visiting Team Findings:

Overall Northland Community and Technical College (NCTC) is a strong two-year public institution led by the

Minnesota State System with a Board of Trustees (BOT) that is fiscally and student oriented. The college has an appropriately developed and BOT approved mission statement. Team found evidence the institution is mission driven and the mission has the support and its programs, support services, and enrollment profiles are consistent with the mission and the college acts in an ethical manner on the part of both the Board and the institution.

While enrollment is declining and most funding is dictated by the state system, the team witnessed facilities that were impressive and demonstrated they are student centered in decision making. The institution continues to look for additional funding streams such as renting unused space, grant funding, etc. The state system has a Chancellor that supports the College Presidents within the system. The Board of Trustees delegates daily operations of the college to the President who works with administration to implement board and college policy. Policies are in place regarding academic freedom for students and faculty as well as integrity in the use of information. Pertinent and required student information is disseminated on the college website and catalog. NCTC has a community that is becoming more diversified and the college is working to try to meet their needs.

Northland Community and Technical College provides evidence to demonstrate it provides education to meet student needs and tries to evaluate that education through program reviews, evaluating the credits they transcripts and determining the quality of those credits. The College's awarding for credit of prior learning and transfer of credit from other institutions is governed by solid policies and procedures. The college also maintains authority over the courses it delivers including dual credit courses. Specialized accreditation is maintained for programs where programmatic accreditation is available and appropriate. Student retention, persistence, and completion data are collected, analyzed, and monitored as an indicator that the student's educational needs are being met and that students are succeeding.

NCTC is one of the institutions that fell in the gap and did not receive a four-year visit. This was their first Open-Pathway visit. The college has many plans, processes, and procedures that involved both internal and external stakeholders. The college has an Academic Affairs Master Plan, Facility Master Plan, Diversity Plan, and Assessment plans. The college indicates these plans are linked to the strategic plan. Some data is collected although most measures are indirect. It is also not clear how the collected data are used in the decision-making process. It is also not clear how these plans are then linked to budget and action plans and how the institution learns from its operational experiences and applies that learning to improve effectiveness, capabilities, and sustainability.

Per Higher Learning Commission instructions "If an institution on the Open Pathway is assigned a focused visit at Year 4 or Year 10, then the team must also recommend that the institution be limited to the Standard Pathway." Therefore, the visiting team is recommending that NCTC be placed on the standard pathway.

Overall Recommendations

Criteria For Accreditation
Met With Concerns

Sanctions Recommendation
No Sanction

Pathways Recommendation
Limited to Standard

Federal Compliance

Does not require monitoring

Multi-Campus Reviewer Form

After conducting the electronic and on-site portions of the multi-campus visit, the assigned peer reviewer completes a separate Multi-campus Reviewer Form for each campus that was reviewed. The reviewer then emails completed forms to the rest of the comprehensive evaluation team members. The team discusses and integrates the findings into its final comprehensive evaluation report in the Assurance System, including any concerns or recommended follow-up.

After the visit, the team chair should submit all Multi-campus Reviewer Forms at hlcommission.org/upload. Select "Final Reports" from the list of submission options to ensure the forms are delivered to the correct HLC staff member. The Multi-campus Report from the institution and the reviewer forms become part of the institution's permanent file and are shared as appropriate with future evaluation teams.

Instructions

A Multi-campus Reviewer Form should be no more than five pages. The form begins with a brief description of the campus and its operations to provide the context for the on-site team's deliberations.

For each review category, provide 2–3 evidence statements that make clear the team's findings in relationship to the Criteria and Core Components. Check one of the following for each category:

- The evidence indicates that the institution fulfills the expectations of the review category. (The reviewer may cite ways to improve.)

- The evidence indicates that there are concerns related to the expectations of the review category.

This form does not request a recommendation from the reviewer. Instead, the full evaluation team is expected to include a discussion of the evidence related to the multi-campus visit in its deliberations about the oversight, management, and educational quality of extended operations of the institution. The team will incorporate evidence on extended operations into the final team report. Further, the full team may determine that a pattern of concern exists across multiple categories of a single campus or more than one campus and may result in a recommendation for additional monitoring or sanction.

Audience: Peer reviewers
Form
Published: 2019 © Higher Learning Commission

Process: Multi-campus Visit
Contact: peerreview@hlcommission.org
Page 1

Report Template

Name of Institution: Northland Community and Technical College

Name and Address of Branch Campus: East Grand Forks Campus, 2022 Central Avenue NE, East Grand Forks, MN 56721

Date and Duration of Visit: 9/30/19-10/2/19

Reviewer: Steven Lewis

1. Campus Overview

Provide a brief description of the scope and operations of the campus. Include information about consortial or contractual arrangements, if applicable.

The East Grand Forks Campus of Northland Community and Technical College was originally constructed as a site for an area vocational technical institute, which was subsequently consolidated as a campus of Northwest Technical College (1992-2003). In 2003, the East Grand Forks campus of Northwest Technical College was merged with Northland Community and Technical College of Thief River Falls, MN to become the current campus it is today.

The East Grand Forks campus is a comprehensive center providing a complete range of programmatic studies and support services for students in the western region of Northland Community and Technical College's service district. According to HLC's definition of "campus," the East Grand Forks location is a campus. Many personnel hired at East Grand Forks are hired strictly by the East Grand Forks administration, and budgeting and personnel payroll are centralized within the Minnesota state system. Other budgetary expenditures specific to this campus are processed at this campus. Moreover, the top administration, including the President, Provost, and all Vice Presidents, spend equal time at both the East Grand Forks and Thief River Falls campuses.

The administration of Northland Community and Technical College views the locations of East Grand Forks and Thief River Falls as two separate campuses, and the college is still in the process of fully merging the operations at Thief River Falls and East Grand Forks.   NCTC identifies the Thief River Falls campus as the permanent address of its college (as it was the original address), but the staff and community of East Grand Forks view the East Grand Forks campus as just as viable as Thief River Falls, which it appears to be.

2. History, Planning, and Oversight

Provide 2–3 evidentiary statements on the effectiveness of the institution's planning, governance and oversight processes at the campus and in relationship to the broader systems of the institution, particularly as they relate to enrollment, budgeting and resource allocation at the institution.

Judgment of reviewer (check one):

Audience: Peer reviewers
Form
Published: 2019 © Higher Learning Commission

Process: Multi-campus Visit
Contact: peerreview@hlcommission.org
Page 2

☒ The evidence indicates that the institution fulfills the expectations of the category.

☐ The evidence indicates that there are concerns related to the expectations of the category.

Evidentiary Statements:

The East Grand Forks campus participates fully with the planning and budgeting processes of NCTC, and senior-level administrators regularly divide their time and office space between the Thief River Falls and East Grand Forks campuses. All administrators, including the President and Provost, have permanent offices at the East Grand Forks campus.

The East Grand Forks campus has a student enrollment greater than that of the campus of Thief River Falls, and it offers a full complement of transfer and technical degree programs. This campus is just as viable as the Thief River Falls campus in terms of student enrollment and services offered.

3. Facilities and Technology

Provide 2–3 evidentiary statements on the institution's facilities and technology at the campus and their suitability to the needs of the students, staff and faculty, as well as the educational offerings. Consider, in particular, classrooms and laboratories (size, maintenance, temperature, etc.); faculty and administrative offices (site, visibility, privacy for meetings, etc.); parking or access to public transit; bookstore or text purchasing services; security; access for people with disabilities; and other services or facilities (food or snack services, study and meeting areas, etc.).

Judgment of reviewer (check one):

☒ The evidence indicates that the institution fulfills the expectations of the category.

☐ The evidence indicates that there are concerns related to the expectations of the category.

Evidentiary Statements:

The East Grand Forks campus is housed in a 164,000 square foot main building, plus several smaller adjacent structures consisting of a full complement of classrooms, lab spaces, and student services. The campus includes offices for 53 full-time and 35 part-time faculty, a cafeteria and student commons, a fully-functioning library, complete student services, free student tutoring, and instructional spaces that house 33 degree programs, including welding, construction, nursing, radiology tech, and fire technology, each with its own dedicated and well-equipped lab spaces.

The campus is housed in a modern, well-kept building that is fully ADA accessible, and it is a welcoming atmosphere for students, employees, and guests.

4. Human Resources

Audience: Peer reviewers
Form
Published: 2019 © Higher Learning Commission

Process: Multi-campus Visit
Contact: peerreview@hlcommission.org
Page 3

Provide 2–3 evidentiary statements on appropriateness of faculty and staff qualifications, sufficiency of staff and faculty for the campus, and the processes for supporting and evaluating personnel at the campus. Consider the processes in place for selecting, training and orienting faculty at the location, as well as the credentials of faculty dedicated to the campus and other faculty.

Judgment of reviewer (check one):

☒ The evidence indicates that the institution fulfills the expectations of the category.

☐ The evidence indicates that there are concerns related to the expectations of the category.

Evidentiary Statements:

The faculty and staff are fully qualified to deliver the instruction and services they are assigned. The campus has more than adequate number of faculty to deliver the instruction of the various programs offered.

The EGF campus dean verified that many of the personnel hired at the campus is managed entirely on the campus, particularly support and adjunct teaching positions. Other hires are conducted through a college-wide search, and may result in positions being filled at either of the main campuses.

5. Student and Faculty Resources and Support

Provide 2–3 evidentiary statements on the student and faculty services and academic resources at the campus, as well as the processes to evaluate, improve and manage them. Consider, in particular, the level of student access (in person, by computer, by phone, etc.) to academic advising/placement, remedial/tutorial services, and library materials/services. Also, consider the level of access to admissions, registration/student records, financial aid, and job placement services, as well as attention to student concerns. Finally, consider the resources needed by faculty to provide the educational offerings.

Judgment of reviewer (check one):

☒ The evidence indicates that the institution fulfills the expectations of the category.

☐ The evidence indicates that there are concerns related to the expectations of the category.

Evidentiary Statements:

All student services that one would expect at a main campus are provided at East Grand Forks. A student at East Grand Forks would be provided a total intake process of admissions and enrollment. The campus boasts a fully-staffed offices of admissions, enrollment, financial aid, advising, tutoring, and many other services to ensure students enjoy a complete collegiate experience.

Audience: Peer reviewers
Form
Published: 2019 © Higher Learning Commission

Process: Multi-campus Visit
Contact: peerreview@hlcommission.org
Page 4

Faculty are provided with all of the necessary resources and technologies in order to create a modern, engaging learning environment. Classrooms and lab spaces are equipped with modern technologies, and a staff of IT technicians are located on site to assist with any needs.

6. Educational Programs and Instructional Oversight

Provide 2–3 evidentiary statements on the institution's capacity to oversee educational offerings and instruction at the campus. Identify whether the institution has adequate controls in place to ensure that information presented to students is ample and accurate. Consider consistency of curricular expectations and policies, availability of courses needed for program and graduation requirements, performance of instructional duties, availability of faculty to students, orientation of faculty/professional development, attention to student concerns.

Judgment of reviewer (check one):

☒ The evidence indicates that the institution fulfills the expectations of the category.

☐ The evidence indicates that there are concerns related to the expectations of the category.

Evidentiary Statements:

The East Grand Forks campus provides a larger number of course offerings and programmatic offerings than NCTC's main campus at Thief River Falls. Faculty at East Grand Forks work in conjunction with the faculty at the main campus and with academic administration to ensure that coursework and learning outcomes are equivalent across the college, and the same academic processes and policies are in place at both campuses.

Faculty at East Grand Forks are available for student inquiry, following the same policies as are present across the institution. Faculty enjoy the same kinds of professional development and are truly equal to the faculty at the Thief River Falls campus in every way.

7. Evaluation and Assessment

Provide 2–3 evidentiary statements on the institution's processes to evaluate and improve the educational offerings of the campus and to assess and improve student learning, persistence and completion sufficiently in order to maintain and improve academic quality at the campus. Consider, in particular, the setting of outcomes, the actual measurement of performance, and the analysis and use of data to maintain/improve quality. Identify how the processes at the branch campus are equivalent to those for assessment and evaluation on the main campus.

Judgment of reviewer (check one):

☒ The evidence indicates that the institution fulfills the expectations of the category.

☐ The evidence indicates that there are concerns related to the expectations of the category.

Evidentiary Statements:

Since the East Grand Forks campus is just as viable a campus as the Thief River Falls campus, all assessment and evaluation processes are in place. The campus serves as a fully-functioning arm of the institution, and all reporting generated here are integral to the institution's planning, budgeting, and assessment processes. In fact, the institution as a whole does not generally distinguish between assessment processes from East Grand Forks and Thief River Falls. The two campuses truly operate in a symbiotic relationship.

8. Continuous Improvement

Provide 2–3 evidentiary statements that demonstrate that the institution encourages and ensures continuous quality improvement at the campus. Consider in particular the institution's planning and evaluation processes that ensure regular review and improvement of the campus, as well as alignment of the branch campus with the mission and goals of the institution as a whole.

Judgment of reviewer (check one):

☒ The evidence indicates that the institution fulfills the expectations of the category.

☐ The evidence indicates that there are concerns related to the expectations of the category.

Evidentiary Statements:

The planning processes at East Grand Forks are the same as those on the Thief River Falls campus, and those processes are fully integrated into the strategic plan and continuous improvement strategies of Northland Community and Technical College. All programs undergo a regular cycle of review, all personnel are evaluated regularly, and all other evaluative processes mirror those that occur college-wide.

To reiterate, Northland Community and Technical College features a unique set of two main campuses that work in tandem with one another to provide the full array of educational and support services to students. The two campuses share all internal processes, provide duplicate space for administration, are led by campus deans and other personnel dedicated to each campus, and the course offerings at both campuses are robust and complete. The East Grand Forks campus is an attractive, modern, and full-service arm of NCTC, providing students and other constituents with quality educational offerings.

Audience: Peer reviewers
Form
Published: 2019 © Higher Learning Commission

Process: Multi-campus Visit
Contact: peerreview@hlcommission.org
Page 6

Institutional Status and Requirements Worksheet

INSTITUTION and STATE:	Northland Community and Technical College, MN
TYPE OF REVIEW*:*	Open Pathway Comprehensive Evaluation
DESCRIPTION OF REVIEW:	The institution was granted an extension until September 1, 2022 to become compliant to the faculty qualification requirement. HLC will review that the institution is in compliance with the faculty qualification requirement at the comprehensive evaluation following the extension date.
	A multi-campus visit will occur in conjunction with the comprehensive evaluation to East Grand Forks, 2022 Central Ave NE, East Grand Forks, MN 56721.
	Visit to include a Federal Compliance Reviewer: Dr. Rick Edgington
DATES OF REVIEW:	9/30/2019 - 10/1/2019

☐ No Change in Institutional Status and Requirements

Accreditation Status

Nature of Institution

Control: Public

Recommended Change:

Degrees Awarded: Associates

Recommended Change:

Reaffirmation of Accreditation:

Year of Last Reaffirmation of Accreditation: 2010 - 2011

Year of Next Reaffirmation of Accreditation: 2019 - 2020

Recommended Change: 2029 - 2030

Accreditation Stipulations

General:

Prior Commission approval is required for substantive change as stated in Commission policy.

Institutional Status and Requirements Worksheet

Recommended Change:

Additional Location:

Prior HLC approval required.

Recommended Change:

Distance and Correspondence Courses and Programs:

Approved for distance education courses and programs. The institution has not been approved for correspondence education.

Recommended Change:

Accreditation Events

Accreditation Pathway   Open Pathway

Recommended Change: Limited to Standard

Upcoming Events

Monitoring

Upcoming Events

None

Recommended Change: Embedded in 2024 four-year review: An embedded report that includes: how the institution collects direct and indirect measures; uses student learning data and program outcome data for program improvement; links assessment plan with strategic plan and budget; uses existing state data in reporting and institutional planning; and, documents how outcomes are reviewed and used for future planning.

Institutional Data

Educational Programs		**Recommended Change:**
Undergraduate		
Certificate	64	_____
Associate Degrees	38	_____
Baccalaureate Degrees	0	_____
Graduate		

Institutional Status and Requirements Worksheet

Master's Degrees	0	_____
Specialist Degrees	0	_____
Doctoral Degrees	0	_____

Extended Operations

Branch Campuses

East Grand Forks, 2022 Central Ave NE, East Grand Forks, MN, 56721

Recommended Change:

Additional Locations

NCTC, Center Street, Roseau, MN, 56751 - Active

Recommended Change:

Correspondence Education

None

Recommended Change:

Distance Delivery

13.1501 - Teacher Assistant/Aide, Associate, Early Childhood and Paraprofessional

15.0303 - Electrical, Electronic and Communications Engineering Technology/Technician, Certificate, Automation Technology

15.0702 - Quality Control Technology/Technician, Certificate, Production Technologies

24.0101 - Liberal Arts and Sciences/Liberal Studies, Associate, Liberal Arts and Sciences

31.0501 - Health and Physical Education/Fitness, General, Certificate, Health and Fitness Specialist

48.0501 - Machine Tool Technology/Machinist, Certificate, Machine Techology

48.0508 - Welding Technology/Welder, Certificate, Welding Technology

49.0101 - Aeronautics/Aviation/Aerospace Science and Technology, General, Certificate, Unmanned Aerial Systems Maintenance Technician

51.0000 - Health Services/Allied Health/Health Sciences, General, Associate, Health Sciences Broad Field

51.0710 - Medical Office Assistant/Specialist, Certificate, Patient Access Specialist

51.0713 - Medical Insurance Coding Specialist/Coder, Certificate, Medical Coding Specialist

51.0716 - Medical Administrative/Executive Assistant and Medical Secretary, Associate, Medical Administrative Assistant

51.0716 - Medical Administrative/Executive Assistant and Medical Secretary, Certificate, Medical Office Specialist

Institutional Status and Requirements Worksheet

51.3901 - Licensed Practical/Vocational Nurse Training, Associate, Practical Nursing

52.0201 - Business Administration and Management, General, Associate, Business AS

52.0201 - Business Administration and Management, General, Associate, Business AS

52.0201 - Business Administration and Management, General, Certificate, Supervisory Leadership

52.0207 - Customer Service Management, Certificate, Customer Service

52.1801 - Sales, Distribution, and Marketing Operations, General, Associate, Sales, Marketing, and Management

52.1801 - Sales, Distribution, and Marketing Operations, General, Associate, Sales, Marketing, and Management

Contractual Arrangements

None

Recommended Change:

Consortial Arrangements

15.0303 - Electrical, Electronic and Communications Engineering Technology/Technician - Certificate - Automation Technology - 360 eTech

15.0702 - Quality Control Technology/Technician - Certificate - Production Technologies - 360 eTech

48.0501 - Machine Tool Technology/Machinist - Certificate - Machine Techology - 360 eTech

48.0508 - Welding Technology/Welder - Certificate - Welding Technology - 360 eTech

Recommended Change: